

APPENDIX 4

**REQUEST FOR BOARD ACTION BY A BOARD MEMBER**

Requester: JOYCE CONNERY January 5, 2016

**Brief description of Requested Action:** Request the Board to approve the attached Tritium letter and Staff Report to be sent to Administrator Klotz. This is an updated version that was altered to address some Board member issues regarding the reporting requirement. While I still believe that asking for the Department to provide the Board with the information requested in the original letter is the appropriate path—both as an indicator of the importance of the issue and to prompt them to solidify their plans as quickly as possible—I do not believe that we should hold up communicating on this important issue.

Attachments (init) Letter and Staff Report (included clean version of any proposed document or modified document)

Summarize any time sensitive considerations:

Requestor signature  1/6/15 Click here to enter a date.

Assistant Executive secretary  01.06.15 Click here to enter a date.

---

	APRVD	DISAPRVD	ABSTAIN	NOT PARTICPATING	COMMENT	DATE
Joyce L. Connery	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
Jessie H. Roberson	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
Sean Sullivan	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
Daniel J. Santos	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
Bruce Hamilton	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
Final Disposition Summary						

Executive Secretary signature \_\_\_\_\_ Click here to enter a date.

---

**AFFIRMATION OF BOARD VOTING RECORD**

**SUBJECT: Request for Board Action by Chairman Joyce Connery to Approve Updated Tritium Letter and Staff Report.**

**Doc Control#2016-045**

The Board, with Board Member(s) Joyce L. Connery, Jessie H. Roberson, Daniel J. Santos, Bruce Hamilton *approving*, Board Member(s) Sean Sullivan *disapproving*, Board Member(s) none *abstaining*, and Board Member(s) none *recusing*, have voted to approve the above document on January 6, 2016.

The votes were recorded as:

	APRVD	DISAPRVD	ABSTAIN	NOT PARTICIPATING*	COMMENT	DATE
Joyce L. Connery	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	01/06/16
Jessie H. Roberson	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	01/06/16
Sean Sullivan	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	01/06/16
Daniel J. Santos	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	01/06/16
Bruce Hamilton	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	01/06/16

\*Reason for Not Participating:

This Record contains a summary of voting on this matter together with the individual vote sheets, views and comments of the Board Members.

  
Assistant Executive/Secretary to the Board

Attachments:

1. Voting Summary
2. Board Member Vote Sheets

cc: Board Members  
OGC  
OGM Records Officer  
OTD

**DEFENSE NUCLEAR FACILITIES SAFETY BOARD**  
**NOTATIONAL VOTE RESPONSE SHEET**



**FROM:** Joyce L. Connery

**SUBJECT:** Request for Board Action by Chairman Joyce Connery to Approve Updated Tritium Letter and Staff Report

Doc Control#2016-045

Approved  Disapproved  Abstain   
Recusal - Not Participating

COMMENTS: Below  Attached  None

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Joyce L. Connery  
 1/6/16  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

**DEFENSE NUCLEAR FACILITIES SAFETY BOARD**  
**NOTATIONAL VOTE RESPONSE SHEET**

**FROM:** Jessie H. Roberson

**SUBJECT:** Request for Board Action by Chairman Joyce Connery to Approve Updated  
Tritium Letter and Staff Report

**Doc Control#2016-045**

**Approved**  **Disapproved** \_\_\_\_\_ **Abstain** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Recusal - Not Participating** \_\_\_\_\_

**COMMENTS:** **Below** \_\_\_\_\_ **Attached** \_\_\_\_\_ **None**

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
**Jessie H. Roberson**

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
**Date**

**DEFENSE NUCLEAR FACILITIES SAFETY BOARD**

**NOTATIONAL VOTE RESPONSE SHEET**

**FROM:** Sean Sullivan

**SUBJECT:** Request for Board Action by Chairman Joyce Connery to Approve Updated Tritium Letter and Staff Report

Doc Control#2016-045

Approved \_\_\_\_\_ Disapproved  X  Abstain \_\_\_\_\_

Recusal – Not Participating \_\_\_\_\_

**COMMENTS:** Below  X  Attached \_\_\_\_\_ None \_\_\_\_\_

I agree that NNSA should update the safety basis for the Tritium Extraction Facility as soon as practical. However, several aspects of proposed letter and staff report perplex me.

First, the staff performed reviews of the TEF safety basis in May and December of 2014. Now – after a lapse of 13 or perhaps 20 months since discovery of the specific issues – the Board is asked to suggest timely action by NNSA. Our significant delay in reporting our findings to the NNSA Administrator is at odds with the proposed characterization of the issues as “important.”

Second, given the significant passage of time since discovery of the issues, we have had sufficient opportunity to independently determine whether additional controls are needed to adequately protect the collocated worker. If additional controls are needed then the proper communication is a recommendation to the Secretary of Energy. If not, then the suggested actions are improvements to safety and may be appropriately delayed by the Administrator as scarce resources are allocated. In either case, I find the proposed correspondence deficient.

Third, the lack of a remote monitor for the fire safety system tank level alarm is labeled a safety issue. As a practical matter, the tank must experience of loss of 100K to 150K gallons of water from nominal level before the alarm set point is reached and given the tank’s proximity to the facility, initial detection of a leak is as likely to be the result of a person stepping in the small pond created by the leak. It is not clear that the additional measures suggested will provide safety improvement commensurate with their cost.

Fourth, the report provides an additional observation suggesting that orifices in certain gas flow piping systems be credited as safety significant due to their purpose in limiting the asphyxiation hazard. An orifice has no moving parts, and in my experience the only testing, inspection, maintenance, repair or replacement ever required for an orifice results from potential plugging. But since the safety function is to limit flow, orifice plugging would actually decrease the asphyxiation hazard. Therefore, designation as safety significant would add administrative requirements without any actual improvement to safety.

  
Sean Sullivan

1/6/16  
Date

**Shelby Qualls**

---

**From:** Daniel J. Santos  
**Sent:** Wednesday, January 06, 2016 11:27 AM  
**To:** Shelby Qualls; Lotus Smith  
**Subject:** Re: Notational Vote Doc#2016-045, Request for Board Action by Chairman Joyce Connery to Approve Updated Tritium Letter and Staff Report - BLUE FOLDER

Approved without comments.

---

**From:** Shelby Qualls  
**Sent:** Wednesday, January 6, 2016 10:37:18 AM  
**To:** Mark Welch; James Biggins; Steven Stokes; Bruce Hamilton; Daniel J. Santos; Jessie Roberson; Joyce Connery; Sean Sullivan  
**Cc:** Lotus Smith; Shelby Qualls  
**Subject:** Notational Vote Doc#2016-045, Request for Board Action by Chairman Joyce Connery to Approve Updated Tritium Letter and Staff Report - BLUE FOLDER

This email is an electronic record of Notational Vote. Voting ballot will follow shortly. Also, accepting electronic votes.

**DEFENSE NUCLEAR FACILITIES SAFETY BOARD  
NOTATIONAL VOTE RESPONSE SHEET**

**FROM:** Members of the Board  
**SUBJECT:** Request for Board Action by Chairman Joyce Connery to Approve Updated Tritium Letter and Staff Report

**DOC# 2016-045**

Office Directors are copied and should provide input, if applicable.

**Approved** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Disapproved** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Abstain** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Recusal – Not Participating** \_\_\_\_\_

**COMMENTS:**  
**Below** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Attached** \_\_\_\_\_  
**None** \_\_\_\_\_

Shelby Qualls  
Assistant Executive Secretary  
Office of the Chairman

**Shelby Qualls**

---

**From:** Bruce Hamilton  
**Sent:** Wednesday, January 06, 2016 10:43 AM  
**To:** Shelby Qualls  
**Subject:** RE: Notational Vote Doc#2016-045, Request for Board Action by Chairman Joyce Connery to Approve Updated Tritium Letter and Staff Report - BLUE FOLDER

I approve.  
I have no comments.

---

**From:** Shelby Qualls  
**Sent:** Wednesday, January 06, 2016 10:37 AM  
**To:** Mark Welch; James Biggins; Steven Stokes; Bruce Hamilton; Daniel J. Santos; Jessie Roberson; Joyce Connery; Sean Sullivan  
**Cc:** Lotus Smith; Shelby Qualls  
**Subject:** Notational Vote Doc#2016-045, Request for Board Action by Chairman Joyce Connery to Approve Updated Tritium Letter and Staff Report - BLUE FOLDER

This email is an electronic record of Notational Vote. Voting ballot will follow shortly. Also, accepting electronic votes.

**DEFENSE NUCLEAR FACILITIES SAFETY BOARD  
NOTATIONAL VOTE RESPONSE SHEET**

**FROM: Members of the Board**  
**SUBJECT: Request for Board Action by Chairman Joyce Connery to Approve Updated Tritium Letter and Staff Report**

**DOC# 2016-045**

Office Directors are copied and should provide input, if applicable.

**Approved** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Disapproved** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Abstain** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Recusal – Not Participating** \_\_\_\_\_

**COMMENTS:**

**Below** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Attached** \_\_\_\_\_  
**None** \_\_\_\_\_

Shelby Qualls  
Assistant Executive Secretary  
Office of the Chairman